

Following the Traces of Turkish-speaking Christians of Anatolia

Guest Editor
Evangelia BALTA

DOĞU DİLLERİ VE EDEBİYATLARININ KAYNAKLARI
150

Yayınlayanlar
Cemal Kafadar & Gönül Alpay Tekin
TÜRKÇE KAYNAKLAR
CL

Türkçe Konuşan Anadolulu Hristiyan Halkın İzlerinde

Hazırlayan
Evangelia BALTA

CİLT I

Yayınladığı yer
Harvard Üniversitesi
Yakındoğu Dilleri ve Medeniyetleri Bölümünde yayınlanmıştır
2021

THE SOURCES OF ORIENTAL LANGUAGES AND LITERATURES

150

Edited by

Cemal Kafadar & Gönül Alpay Tekin

TURKISH SOURCES

CL

Following the Traces of Turkish-speaking Christians of Anatolia

Guest Editor

Evangelia BALTA

VOLUME I

Published at

The Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations

Harvard University

2021

Copyright © 2021 by the Editors
All rights reserved

•
Bütün telif hakları yayınlayanlara aittir

ŞEN YILDIZ YAY. MATBAACILIK LTD. ŞTİ.

Managing Editor of
THE SOURCES OF ORIENTAL LANGUAGES AND LITERATURES
Günay KUT

•
Designed and arranged by
İbrahim TEKİN

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 70-131003



Class of 2019



Class of 2017



Class of 2018

Contents - İçindekiler

Evangelia Balta

Preface

(9-12)



VOLUME I

Book-production in Karamanlidika and Armeno-Turkish

Georgia Christodoulou

La contribution de Germain d'Alexandrette à la renaissance de l'éducation en Cappadoce au XVIII^e siècle (15-39)

Matthias Kappler

The first printed Turkish grammar in Greek and European *Ars grammatica* (41-67)

Anastasia Tsapanidou

Sophronios Hadji Aslanoglou et une version karamanlie du *Sacrifice d'Abraham* (69-101)

Haris Theodorelis-Rigas & Firuzan Melike Sümertas

Archaeology as Epic. Language, Transmission and Politics in the editions of Patriarch Konstantios I's *Konstantinias* (103-136)

Mehmet Fatih Uslu

Mezarda Bir İzdivaç (Marriage in the Grave) A Curious Redemption of the Ottoman Dandy (137-146)

Edith Gülcin Ambros

The place of Karamanlı Turkish folk songs in the larger field of Turkish folk songs Stavridis' collection (1896) in comparison with Kúnos' collection (1889) (147-184)

Gulşen Sakhatova

Expression of modal meanings in *Karamanlidika*: Preliminary overview (185-201)

Leonidas Moiras

A Karamanlidika edition on the history of the Greek Revolution of 1821 (203-222)

William Stroebel

The Greek Vampire Goes East: Vampirism, Irredentism, and Language Politics in a Karamanli-Turkish Translation of Aristotelis Valaoritis' "Thanasis Vayas" (223-256)

FOLLOWING THE TRACES OF TURKISH-SPEAKING CHRISTIANS OF ANATOLIA

VOLUME II

Karamanlı Senior Civil Servants

Kaan Doğan & A. Çağrı Başkurt

Kuruluşundan Karamanlı Kostaki Adosidis Paşa'nın Tayin ve Azline
Sisam Beyliği Meselesi (1832-1885)

(265-304)

Leonidas Moiras

Konstantinos Adosidis: His Two Terms in the Office of Prince of Samos
(1873-1874 and 1879-1885)

(305-323)



Turkish-speaking Orthodox Christian communities in Anatolia and Istanbul

İsmail Yaşanlar

İncesulu Karamanlılar Üzerine Demografik Bir İnceleme

(327-375)

H. Veli Aydin

19. Yüzyılda Ürgüp ve Türkçe Konuşan Rum Ortodoks Cemaati
Üzerine Bazı Gözlemler

(377-416)

Stefo Benlisoy

“Aghios Kaisareias Meselesi”: Dissent and factionalism in the late 19th century
Orthodox community of Kayseri

(417-448)

Sada Payir & Athanasios Nikolaidis

Cappadocia Ottoman Construction Company (1912)
by Arsenios Istanbolloglou and partners

(449-464)

Stefo Benlisoy

Business in Karamanlidika: The Ottoman Construction Company “Cappadocia”

(465-473)



Identity issues for the Karamanlides

Foti Benlisoy & Stefo Benlisoy

“Cumhuriyetin coşkulu sözcüsü” İsmail Habib Sevük
ve “Hıristiyan Türkler” meselesi

(477-502)

Muhammed Ceyhan

Papa-Eftim'in Türk Ortodoks Kilisesini Ayakta Tutmak Amacıyla
Hükümete Sunduğu İki Mektup

(503-523)

Maria Zerva

“Thirty times Greek”: Memory, Otherness and Identity construction among
descendants of Turkish speaking Greek Orthodox refugees in the 21st century

(525-566)

Preface

It was with great honour and delight that I welcomed Gönül Tekin's proposal that I should prepare one volume of *THE SOURCES OF ORIENTAL LANGUAGES AND LITERATURES* dedicated to Karamanlidika issues. It came as a follow-up to another older invitation. In 2010, she suggested that I organise a seminar on Karamanlidika Studies as part of the Intensive Ottoman and Turkish Summer School that she founded in 1996 with her husband Şinasi Tekin in Cunda (Ayvalık).

I am grateful to her for both invitations.

With the inclusion of the seminar in the curriculum of the Summer School, Karamanlidika Studies became officially established as a teaching subject in Ottoman Studies. Each summer from 2011 on, young historians beginning their postgraduate studies were introduced to a new facet of Ottoman Studies and its traditional historical and philological fields, namely the history and culture of non-Muslim populations in the Ottoman Empire, who spoke Turkish but wrote it in the alphabet of their sacred books: the Orthodox Rums in Greek, the Armenians in Armenian, and, the Jews in Hebrew. These new fields reshaped Ottoman Studies, the aim being to study them alongside the dominant culture of the empire. Referencing the diverse cultural heritage of the Ottomans, the seminar focuses on the history and culture of the Turcophone Orthodox of Anatolia, the Karamanlides. One feels a great sense of delight when observing students from various countries choosing Karamanlidika Studies as the subject of their research and publishing excellent work.

The book is the expression of my gratitude for the School's contribution to the advancement of Karamanlidika Studies on the global academic scene.

To celebrate the School's 25th anniversary in 2020, volume 150 of the *THE SOURCES OF ORIENTAL LANGUAGES AND LITERATURES* was to be dedicated to Karamanlidika Studies. However, due to the COVID-19 pandemic, publication was postponed until 2021. The work contains 19 original papers that present a variety of approaches to the Turkish-speaking non-Muslim populations of the Ottoman Empire. The topics are organised into four sections, although it is difficult to separate them, as the subjects of the studies are closely related to one another.

*

The first section, **Book-production in Karamanlidika and Armeno-Turkish**, examines the following questions:

The educational and publishing activity of a circle of learned clergymen (the hieromonk Germanos and priest Sofronios Hatzi Aslanoglou) in their attempt to enlighten their fellow Anatolians.

The first Greek edition of Turkish grammar, published with Greek characters in Vienna by the physician Dimitrios Alexandrides in the early 19th century. Linguistic questions are also examined, using the example of the missionary edition of *Ἐν πόνησι ὡνναχκιάροι τιζόντες τερ χαλ χελάς* (En büyük günahkâr içün derhal helas, 1906).

The primary focus of the study in this collection was the cultural transfer from the Greek to the Turkish language. The volume also presents the Karamanlidika versions of works such as the popular drama *H Θυσία του Αβραάμ* [The Sacrifice of Abraham]; *Κωνσταντινιάς* [Konstantinias], a description of the monuments in Constantinople; *Ιστορία της ελληνικής επανάστασης του 1821* [History of the Greek Revolution of 1821]; and the poem “Θανάσης Βάγιας” [Thanasis Vagias] by Aristotelis Valaoritis. The conditions of their transfer to the foreign language section, that of Hellenism, are discussed and the factors contributing to this cultural transfer are laid out. This section also includes a study of Armeno-Turkish (Turkish in Armenian script) literature, the only one in the volume: the work by Misak' Kōchunean *Mezarda Bir İzdiveç* (Marriage in the Grave), his only work in Armeno-Turkish.

Lastly, this section includes a comparative study of two anthologies of Turkish folk poetry from Anatolia. These works were released concurrently in the late 19th century, written by the Hungarian Ignácz Kúnos and the Rum Stavros Stavrides. Kúnos collected these popular songs through localized research in Anatolian villages. The teacher Stavrides recorded them from Turkish-speaking Rum Anatolians living in Istanbul. Products of an early anthropological study which depicted the common Turkish folk traditions of Muslims and Christians in Anatolia, Kúnos wrote using the Latin alphabet, and Stavrides, the Greek alphabet.

*

The second section entitled **Karamanli Senior Civil Servants** covers a topic with minimal contributions to date (if one excludes the older studies on Avraam Vaporidis and Savvas Rumi Pasha). Archival sources are used to investigate the contemporary press, the lives, and the careers of Anatolian Turkish-speaking Rums who served as officers in the Ottoman state. Two studies in the volume present the work of Kostakis Adosidis, Prince of Samos, from Ottoman and Greek sources. Hailing from Stephana in Cappadocia (today Reşadiye), he served in various positions, rose through the ranks of the Ottoman hierarchy, and, distinguished for his education and administrative skills, became Prince of Samos and Governor-General of Crete. A supporter of Greco-Ottomanism, he expressed his ideological viewpoint in the excellent preface to *Στοιχεία της Οθωμανικής Γραμματικής* [Elements of Ottoman Grammar] which he published in 1850, urging his Rum compatriots to learn the Turkish language, in order to participate on an equal footing with the other nationalities in the large Ottoman family where they lived and worked.

The topic is fascinating, as, apart from the individuals studied, it depicts the climate amidst momentous changes taking place in the Ottoman Empire. I would like this topic to become the subject of further systematic study, to someday produce a biographical dictionary, not only of distinguished but also of minor Turkish-speaking Rum Orthodox individuals who served the Ottoman state, without ever taking a place on the pages of history.

PREFACE

The third section entitled **Turkish-speaking Orthodox Christian communities in Anatolia and Istanbul**, brings together studies on the life of the Anatolian Rums. Their lives were divided between their birthplace and the *gurbet*, the melting-pot of Istanbul and other urban centres in the empire. Men who moved to Istanbul to prosper would send the fruits of their labours to the families and communities they left behind. The wealth they accumulated allowed them to build churches, schools, and mansions in the middle of Anatolia that have stood the test of time. A prime example is the study of Incesu, showing the magnitude of the migration flow to Istanbul and their occupations in the places where they settled. An overwhelming majority became grocers in the neighbourhoods of Istanbul. One cannot help but remember the wonderful description of the Anatolian grocer in the novel ‘Lambo Usta’ by Selahattin Enis. The study of the Rum community in Ürgüp/Prokopi, based on Ottoman and Greek sources, traces its population from the 15th century up to the Population Exchange and its settlement in Neo Prokopi in Evia.

With the discovery of a Karamanlidika pamphlet, the articles of association of a construction company named Cappadocia, founded by Anatolian businessmen in 1912, two studies in the same section reveal yet another fascinating field dealing with the study of Anatolians’ business and commercial activities in the large urban centres of the empire. Having left the poor villages of Anatolia, they gathered in professional associations, charitable and cultural organizations. Relying on mutual support, they tried to cope with the difficulties of emigration, as well as helping their place of origin. The example of the Cappadocian businessmen is indicative. They founded the construction company with the symbolic name “Cappadocia”, publishing the company’s statutes in Karamanlidika and printing its shares in Karamanlidika, hoping to raise capital from their Turkish-speaking compatriots to support their new company. There is, I believe, a tremendous potential for researching the business presence of Turkish-speaking Orthodox Cappadocians in Istanbul and Smyrna, as well as in the other urban centres of the empire. It is well-known that Cappadocian migrants, if we focus our attention on Ottoman lands, were spread over a large expanse from Adana and Alexandretta to the cities of Pontus.

The final paper in this section examines the ideological conflicts taking place within the Greek Orthodox communities of Anatolia and the role played by the Anatolians in Istanbul and other urban centres. The Patriarchate and the Associations of Anatolians spread the Greek language through local ecclesiastical authorities and these played a significant role in shaping the Greek national consciousness in the traditional Orthodox communities. The choice of an educational system in the schools of Turkish-speaking Orthodox Anatolians and the curriculum became key issues in political conflicts, reflecting similar clashes between supporters and opponents of Patriarch Joachim III, as well as disputes during the Bulgarian Schism.

*

The fourth section entitled **Identity issues for the Karamanlides** approaches from different viewpoints and at different periods, the question of the identity of Turkish-speaking Orthodox Rums, who, during the Population Exchange, were forced to abandon their homelands and settle in Greece. Through the writings of Ismail Habib Sevük, the first work traces the views formed after the Greco-Turkish war of

FOLLOWING THE TRACES OF TURKISH-SPEAKING CHRISTIANS OF ANATOLIA

1919-22 concerning the Turkish national identity. The idea was put forth in the late 19th – early 20th centuries that Turks were indigenous to Anatolia and therefore, Turkish-speaking Anatolian Rums were Turks. The clear result of this in the 1930s was that ‘Christian Turks’ were not accepted as part of the Turkish national body, since Turkishness as it had developed, still excluded non-Muslims. Islam continued to define the Turkish national identity.

The second study focuses on actions taken by Papa Eftim during the period of Athenagoras’ ascension to the patriarchal throne. He raises again the issue of the Christian Turks, sensing its marginalisation by the charismatic new patriarch, and he goes as far as recommending to İnönü the return of exchangeable Karamanlides to Turkey to reinforce the small flock of the Turkish Orthodox Patriarchate. Proposals that fell on deaf ears, proving that the issue was irrevocably over for the Turkish state, which though, for its own political reasons, continues to maintain the Turkish Orthodox Patriarchate.

The third and final work, citing the example of the descendants of the Turkish-speaking Bafralides who founded Bafra in Epirus after the Exchange, studies how the identity/otherness is experienced in critical times, such as in World War II and the Civil War in Greece, and how this situation is handled today by the descendants of the Turkish-speaking Bafralides. A fascinating approach to a topic that highlights the multiplicity and variability of social, political, ethnic and other identities, as well as the mutual definition of ‘identity/otherness’ with the example of the Turkish-speaking refugees in Greece.

*

In concluding this introductory note, I would like to stress that its purpose was not to present the studies of the work but to describe the prospects opened up by their topics for new research which will contribute to the advancement of Karamanlidika Studies.

I would like to thank all those who took up my invitation to participate in the creation of this volume through their research and writing. Many colleagues and friends assisted me with this project, from its inception to its publication. Thanks go to Yorgo Dedes, Nikos Livanos, Danielle Morichon, Niki Stavridi, Fatma Ergünyer, Ayşegül Acar-Dreyer and Alizé Dreyer. And as always, I am particularly grateful to my two stalwart colleagues who support me in the publication of my books, Carol Haros and Maria Stefossi.

Evangelia Balta
Athens, March 25, 2021