

KARAMANLIDIKA LEGACIES

EDITED BY
EVANGELIA BALTA



THE ISIS PRESS
ISTANBUL

KARAMANLIDIKA LEGACIES

© 2018 Evangelia Balta & The Isis Press

Published by

The Isis Press

Yazmacı Emine sokak 4/A

Burhaniye-Beylerbeyi

34676 Istanbul

Tel.: 90 (0216) 321 38 51

Fax: 90 (0216) 321 86 66

e-mail: isis@theisispress.org

www.theisispress.org

First edition 2018

ISBN: 978-975-428-610-6

Baskı: İSİS

Yazmacı Emine sokak 6

Burhaniye-Beylerbeyi

34676 Istanbul

Tel.: 90 (0216) 321 38 51

Fax: 90 (0216) 321 86 66

e-mail: isis@theisispress.org

KARAMANLIDIKA LEGACIES

Edited by

Evangelia Balta

THE ISIS PRESS
ISTANBUL

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|-----|
| <i>Introduction</i> | 7 |
| | |
| Edith Gülçin Ambros <i>The comparison of a Karamanli edition with a regular Ottoman edition of the folk-tale Köroğlu: morphological and syntactic aspects</i> | 13 |
| | |
| Stavros T. Anestidis <i>Hans Christian Andersen'in bir masalından esinlenen Karamanlıca bir hikâye: Πῖρ Βαλιδῆ</i> | 39 |
| | |
| Evangelia Balta <i>Novels published in Karamanlidika</i> | 49 |
| | |
| Evangelia Balta – Niki Stavridi <i>Poèmes karamanlis d'Homeros, Échangeable originaire d'Ürgüp (Macrimalli d'Eubée, 1956)</i> | 81 |
| | |
| Stefo Benlisoy <i>Nevşehirli, doktor, eğitimci, sendikacı: Doktor Arhangelos Gavril kimdi?</i> | 107 |
| | |
| Ekrem Ekinçi <i>An Apology to the Karamanlis, the Turkish-speaking Rum Orthodox population</i> | 127 |
| | |
| Matthias Kappler <i>The Karamanli Divan by the 'Aşık Talib and Ottoman Lyric Poetry: a Preliminary Approach</i> | 141 |
| | |
| Sophia Matthaïou <i>A Pioneering Translation Project in Karamanlidika : Aristotle's Physiognomics</i> | 167 |
| | |
| Popi Moupagiätzi <i>Eski bir fotoğraftan Karamanlıca bir kitaba uzanan yolculuk</i> | 177 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Athanasios Nikolaidis | |
| <i>A collection of Karamanlidika publications</i> | 185 |
| Alexandra Sfoini | |
| <i>La traduction karamanli du Récit d'Alexandre de Macédoine</i> <i>(1843, 1871)</i> | 195 |
| Will Stroebel | |
| <i>The Ballad of Kosmas Tsekmezoglou</i> | 209 |
| <i>List of Contributors</i> | 229 |
| <i>Index</i> | 231 |

Introduction

Evangelia Balta

This volume comes to join the three previous ones that contained the papers of participants in the international conferences on Karamanlidika Studies held between 2008 and 2013¹. The hard times brought about by the outbreak of the financial crisis and its increasingly damaging effects did not allow in the meantime for the convening of a fourth Workshop, which would have provided the opportunity for a new meeting of interested scholars to discuss research issues, announce data and desiderata that emerged, to create in other words all those conditions that out of necessity reposition each academic subject in an updated context.

I therefore considered it appropriate to invite all those willing to contribute to an innovative study towards the creation of a volume that would continue the dialogue started by the Workshops, and would allow an idea to be formed of the new² research launched in the intervening five-year period. The twelve contributions made by colleagues who hastened to respond to our invitation, apart from their writers' interests, outline to some extent the trends being set in the field of Karamanlidika Studies, judging from the topics of the studies submitted, which are indicative of the interests prevailing on the horizon, as far as I can see before me.

Although the number of studies included on the pages of the book is limited, two groups of approaches with a common theme can clearly be seen.

¹ *Cries and Whispers in Karamanlidika Books*, Proceedings of the First International Conference on Karamanlidika Studies (Nicosia, 11th–13th September 2008), Edited by Evangelia Balta and Matthias Kappler, Harrassowitz Verlag: Wiesbaden 2010; *Between Religion and Language: Turkish-Speaking Christians, Jews and Greek-Speaking Muslims and Catholics in the Ottoman Empire*, edited by Evangelia Balta and Mehmet Ölmez, Eren: Istanbul, 2011; *Cultural Encounters in the Turkish-speaking Communities of the Late Ottoman Empire*, edited by Evangelia Balta with the contribution of Mehmet Ölmez, The Isis Press: Istanbul 2014.

² Whilst the number of those involved with Karamanlidika Studies is increasing as time passes, and one would expect a corresponding increase in the production of new research, yet there are very few studies based on research that provide new data, new viewpoints on the field. In most cases things that have been said for decades are repeated, and recently, apart from previous occasional copies, plagiarism of entire works has been observed. *O tempora, o mores!!* Unfortunately even Karamanlidika Studies has not escaped such unethical behaviour.

One can first see the trend created in research into Karamanlidika poetry, both published and unpublished, which is most likely a continuation of relevant studies published after 2014. Will Stroebel republishes Kosmas Tsekmezoglou's ballad with corrections in the reading of certain lines and alongside it the English translation, revealing some researchers' interest in the poetry composed by Exchangeables after settling in Greece.

The same pattern is followed by the second study (Evangelia Baltaniki Stavridi) which publishes an unknown poetical work by the Turkish-speaking refugee Ioannis Papadopoulos (or Ioannis Charalamboglou) with the nick-name Homiros (Homer) from Prokopi (Ürgüp) in Cappadocia. Homiros was discovered by Eugène Dalleggio in Makrimalli in Euboea during his expedition to the refugee villages there in 1956. The verses written by the hand of the folk poet Homiros in a small notebook recently discovered in the archive of the Centre for Asia Minor Studies, are accompanied by Dalleggio's notes that were found in his archive kept at the Gennadius Library.

The third study in the section is signed by Matthias Kappler, who examines the *Divan of Aşık Talip* in the light of Ottoman lyric poetry, following the thread of older studies in this sector. This is the only case of a published *divan* composed by a Turkish-speaking Cappadocian in the 19th century. Kappler's study appears next to the corresponding one by M. Sabri Koz and I would like to believe that it is the harbinger of a future publication of this unique *divan* composition in Karamanlidika. It would indeed be fortunate if this poetic work could at some point be reissued.

In the last study in this section Edith Gülçin Ambros compares the 1872 Karamanlı edition of the Turkish folk-tale *Köroğlu* with the Ottoman edition of 1908, presenting data on popular language as spoken towards the end of the 19th century. The linguistic aspect of the study highlights sociocultural phenomena, namely the multi-faceted and hierarchical relations between cultures, as seen in the construction of "popular language". It opens up new fields of research, calling attention to the need for the study of the Turkish language in common texts that were released in Karamanlidika, Turkish (Ottoman script) and Armeno-Turkish.

In concluding this brief presentation of the studies on Karamanlidika poetry, I would like to point out that this section, consisting of these four studies, turns a page in Karamanlidika Studies, revealing the extent of research that remains to be done in this sector. I indicatively give a few examples. One desideratum is the collection of poems published in Karamanlidika periodicals and newspapers, as also is research into the identity of their authors. The tracking down, cataloguing and publishing of poetry collections on manuscripts lying in various archives and libraries is still outstanding. These are, I repeat, some representative examples that show a range of as yet completely unexplored fields in Karamanlidika studies.

The second section of the volume houses studies that explore the translation phenomenon in historical time. The overwhelming majority of Karamanlidika books are known to be none other than translations and adaptations of works from various languages. This is therefore an excellent field of observation that allows us to monitor the process of a *transfer culturel* over the two centuries of its printed production, the aims that defined it and its reception, using language as a vehicle.

Sophia Matthaïou studies the Karamanlidika edition of Aristotle's *Physiognomics*, an edition edited by Anastasios Karakioulafoglou. This innovative work, steeped in the spirit of the Enlightenment that prevailed during the corresponding years in the Greek-speaking intellectual world, led by Adamantios Korais, was released in 1819 and includes the original text accompanied by its rendition in the *koine* Modern Greek language, which made it accessible to the Greek-speaking reader, while the Turkish translation provided on the opposite page was intended for the Turkish-speaking Orthodox Anatolian. In the early 19th century Anastasios Karakioulafoglou undertook the task, unprecedented in Karamanlidika literature, of publishing an ancient classical text to enlighten his compatriots, a text that referred on the one hand to the glorious ancient Greek past, and on the other hand was decidedly useful in their everyday lives.

Alexandra Sfoini, well-known for her systematic involvement with Greek translations by foreign writers, discusses two Karamanlidika translations of the “Φυλλάδα του Μεγαλέξανδρου” [*Fyllada tou Megalexandrou*], which were released in the mid-19th century, placing them in the political and cultural context of the historical conjuncture. This folk text, very popular among the Greeks during the years of Ottoman domination, the legendary story of the life, exploits and travels of the great Macedonian king, is examined in the context of the cultural tradition of the Turkish-speaking Orthodox Rums of Anatolia, and it underlines the need for its correlation with its Ottoman adaptations, also a fascinating field that remains open to research.

Stavros Anestidis releases in Turkish the Karamanlidika translation of the story by Spyridon Vassiliadis “A Mother”, which was published in the periodical *H Apeτή / Fazilet* in 1910, a story inspired by the corresponding story by Hans Christian Andersen (*Historien om en moder*). The Turkish translation of this Greek story is part of a wider process of cultural transfer, as the transfer of the European original intervened.

The fourth study in this module (Evangelia Balta) concerns the first cataloguing of Karamanlidika novels published as books or in instalments in newspapers and periodicals. The catalogue is accompanied by brief comments on the original title of the novel and data on its existing Greek, Ottoman, Armeno-Turkish, Ladino editions, plus information about the translators and publishers of the Karamanlidika edition. The study wishes to show the extent of the interlingual horizon in the Ottoman Empire and the channels of expressive affinity and communication between the ethno-religious communities in the empire, the field of observation being the western novels translated into the Turkish language, which, printed in various alphabets,

were widely spread and much read in the 19th century. Alongside these the few Greek and the even fewer, very rare, works written in the Turkish language with Greek characters are presented. In studying the case of Karamanlidika novels we inevitably explore the field of Turkish translations, a topic that Ottoman Studies has systematically begun to work on over the last two decades

*

The study by Stefo Benlisoy, with no other companion in the book, presents the life and work of a pioneering physician, Archangelos Gavriil from Nevşehir. Benlisoy follows his journey from Cappadocia to Istanbul where he went to study, to Epirus, to work, and to Athens, where he became acquainted with the first trade unions and organizations that were to seal his ideology and political conscience. In 1908 he became the leader of the "Anadolu Osmanlı Şimendiferleri Şirketi Memurin ve Müstahdemini Cemiyet-i İttihadiyesi", one of the first workers' organizations formed in Istanbul during the Constitutional Era (*Meşrutiyet Devrimi*). He fought for an improvement in working conditions for the labourers on the Anatolian Railways. Stefo Benlisoy accumulated valuable material that outlines the numerous activities of Archangelos Gavriil, which extend even to the field of Karamanlidika literature.

This study is one of the few in the sector of Karamanlidika Studies that deal with the work and the personality of Cappadocian scholars, with the "minor ones" that historiography has not shown as "protagonists" remaining unknown, apart from a very narrow circle of researchers. There are no entries on them in encyclopedic dictionaries or when there are, the biographical details are not sufficient to reconstruct their lives. Yet they are personages with a significant presence in Karamanlidika literature, with a remarkable intellectual production. They are the people who worked in a variety of ways to enlighten the Turkish-speaking Anatolians. The need has been expressed on other occasions for the creation of a database on this population. Some entries on authors of Karamanlidika books have begun to appear on the pages of the *Encyclopedia of Islam* and this undoubtedly shows excellent progress.

*

The book also includes three personal submissions. Each testifies from a different perspective to the active interest of their writers in Karamanlidika Studies.

Thanasis Nikolaidis, mechanical and production engineer, methodical collector of Karamanlidika publications and manuscripts, appeared as a speaker at the round table held as part of the 2nd Workshop of Karamanlidika Studies, to which collectors and antiquarian booksellers had been invited to participate in the discussion. He recently collaborated on the publication of the diary of a Karamanli soldier on the front lines during World War I. He

participates in the book with his account of the motives behind his collection and publicizes its catalogue. Printed matter from his collection is catalogued in the first volume of the reissue of the Karamanlidika Bibliography published by İşBankası Yayınları (2018).

Ekrem Ekinci, chemical engineer, former rector of Işık University, has been systematically involved in Karamanlidika Studies since at least 2009 when I first met him, following his invitation to me to give a lecture on the Karamanlis and their culture at Işık University. I thus met yet another scholar of Karamanlidika Studies from outside the usual field of the humanities. Over the years I met several more. Ekrem Ekinci's contribution to the book sets out the motives that impelled him to write a book on the Turkish-speaking Orthodox of Anatolia, who were forced to abandon their homeland under the terms of the Treaty of Lausanne.

I have left till last the presentation of the contribution made by Popi Moupagiatzi, which unveils the chronicle of the research inspired by the photograph of her grandfather Prodromos Amfilochios or Polatoglou from Sille in Konya, who according to a report by János Eckmann, had been included in the Bibliography as the author of one of the last dated works in Karamanlidika literature (Paphos, 1935). The painstaking research carried out by his granddaughter, Popi Moupagiatzi, in the Cypriot press, where information about the publication of the booklet *Προσευχάι* [*Prayers*] had been found, provided the Karamanlidika Bibliography not only with confirmation of the circulation of this publication, but also with the discovery of a copy in the Bodleian Library. The attractively-written diary of this research reminded us of stories about locating lost Karamanlidika editions that we experienced while compiling the volumes of the Karamanlidika Bibliography. Finding this edition pleased me for yet another reason which concerns me personally. The release in 1997 of the volume which included all the new additions I had found during the decade 1987-1997 resulted in my meeting and becoming friends with the remarkable Harid Fedai, a wise researcher of Cypriot history. He sent me a letter through Mersin, asking me for more information than that provided in the entry in the bibliography. During our meetings in Turkey and from 2008 in Cyprus until his death in 2017, he would always ask if there was any new information on the edition of the "prayers of Paphos" as he called them. Thanks to the efforts of Popi Moupagiatzi the book was finally discovered. It was printed in Paphos in 1935 and is one of the last or possibly even the last Karamanlidika book to be released.

I am very grateful to my colleagues and friends who helped to create this book, and are attending this meeting. I owe favours to my friend Giorgos Dedes who supports the efforts being made to promote Karamanlidika Studies.